

**BEFORE INDEPENDENT HEARING COMMISSIONERS IN CHRISTCHURCH
TE MAHERE Ā-ROHE I TŪTOHUA MŌ TE TĀONE O ŌTAUTAHĪ**

IN THE MATTER

of the Resource Management Act
1991

AND

IN THE MATTER

of the hearing of submissions on
Plan Change 13 (Heritage) to the
Christchurch District Plan

**SUMMARY OF EVIDENCE OF GAVIN STANLEY ON BEHALF OF
CHRISTCHURCH CITY COUNCIL**

HERITAGE ITEMS: QUANTITY SURVEYING

17 June 2025

SUMMARY STATEMENT

1. My name is **Gavin Stanley**. I am a founding member, shareholder and Senior Quantity Surveyor at Rhodes + Associates Limited.
2. I have a BSc in Quantity Surveying and have worked as a Quantity Surveyor for 35 years for both contractors and in Private Practice, I have been involved with numerous Heritage projects both here and in the United Kingdom.
3. I have prepared evidence on behalf of the **Christchurch City Council (Council)** to provide comment on quotations and estimates provided by building owners and their representatives. I reaffirm that I am complying with the Environment Court's Code of Conduct for Expert Witnesses in presenting this summary of my evidence and responding to the submitter's evidence.
5. My evidence relates only to the quotation provided by the building owner and relates to whether or not the quotation is reasonable. I had not been appointed to check the quantities provided or to give any commentary of methodology for repair or rebuild.
6. I have provided the report for the Dwelling, Daresbury and Setting – 9 Daresbury Lane, 67 and 67B Fendalton Road:
 - a) As set out and detailed in my rebuttal evidence under PC14 (attached as Appendix B to my PC13 evidence and Appendix 3 to Mr Clease's PC13 evidence for Daresbury Ltd). I have considered the repair estimate prepared for this site by Mr Harrison on behalf of Daresbury Limited:
 - (i) I corrected my gross floor area in line with Mr Harrison's calculation and have used that within my revised calculations for alternative replacement buildings (attached as Appendix 3, item 9 to 10 to Mr Clease's PC13 evidence for Daresbury Ltd).
 - (ii) I had adjusted my fluctuation calculations to reflect new data from Stats NZ which had the effect of increasing Milne Construction's estimate. Mr Harrison agreed with the calculation being based on the contract NZS 3910:2013 (attached as Appendix 3, item 15 to Mr Clease's PC13 evidence for Daresbury Ltd).
 - (iii) Mr Harrison had suggested a margin of 10%, I have left the margin as per Milne Constructions assessment of 7.5% which is reflected

by the current market conditions. (attached as Appendix 3, item 12(a) to Mr Cleese's PC13 evidence for Daresbury Ltd).

- (iv) With reference to betterment, following information provided within Mr Harrison's report I agreed with his comments on the HVAC system but disagree to the extent of Fire System and Curtains, although I have not adjusted Mr Harrison's figures.
 - (v) I have adjusted my Preliminary and General allowances although this is still a lower value than Mr Harrison's proposal.
- b) Since I prepared evidence for PC14, I have updated the cost escalation for the current period, (attached as Appendix D of my Statement of Primary Evidence dated 28 May 2025).
- c) Referring to my Statement of Primary Evidence dated 28 May 2025, particularly paragraph 20, I have made a further adjustment to the repair estimate to exclude specified external works (brick paving, driveway, and fountain) as detailed in the attached **Appendix A** which enables direct comparisons with the replacement options using cost per m2 as outlined in the attached **Appendix B**.
- d) The adjusted repair cost per m2, excluding specified external works for remedial works to Rhodes + Associates Option 3 as set out in attached Appendix B, identified as Option 3a, effectively reduces the cost by \$185/m2. Similar adjustments have been applied to Mr Harrison's estimate, set out in attached Appendix B, identified as Option 4a, which effectively reduces that cost by \$159/m2.
- e) In summary:
- (i) Including external works
 - (1) There is a difference between our repair estimates where my 'Repair Estimate Option 3 – Adjusted Option 2' is \$7,984,555 and Mr Harrison's estimate Option 4 is \$8,437,293, a difference of \$452,738.
 - (ii) Excluding specified external works, brick paving, driveway and fountain
 - (1) After applying updated escalation, both Mr Harrison's and my replacement replica costs match at \$8,975,538, however

there is a difference between our repair estimates where my 'Repair Estimate Option 3a – Adjusted Option 2' is \$7,782,642 and Mr Harrison's estimate Option 4a is \$8,263,902, a difference of \$481,260. The difference between repair and replica varies from an additional \$711,636 to \$1,192,896

- (2) The differences between the repair estimate 'Option 3a – Adjusted Option 3' of \$7,782,642 and proposed modern structure replacement buildings ranging from \$7,853,868 and \$11,218,878 would either give a saving of \$71,226 or an extra over cost \$3,436,236.

d) I confirm I have read the 'Statement of evidence of Jonathan Clease (planning) on behalf of Daresbury Limited' dated 6 June 2025 and that it does not raise any new matters for me to respond to.

Date: 17 June 2025

Gavin Stanley

External Works to be excluded from repair estimate Option 3**MILNE CONSTRUCTION ESTIMATE**

Percentage adjustments in line with Statement of Rebuttal Evidence of Gavin Stanley (Quantity Surveyor) on behalf of Christchurch City Council 9 October 2023, Appendix C

Brick Paving - Supply and Install Border with Paved Brick Infill including New Concrete Base where Required	\$	60,000.00
Driveway - Resurface Asphalt	\$	36,610.00
Driveway - Reset Tile Paver Boarder to Asphalt Driveway where required	\$	3,600.00
Fountain - Requires Repair	\$	2,500.00

Total		\$ 102,710.00
--------------	--	----------------------

Preliminaries	10.00%	10,271.00
Margins	7.50%	8,473.58
Contract Contingencies	10.00%	12,145.46
Other Development Costs	20.00%	26,720.01

Total Adjustment		\$ 160,320.04
-------------------------	--	----------------------

External Works to be excluded from repair estimate Option 4**MILNE CONSTRUCTION ESTIMATE**

Percentage adjustments in line with Statement of Evidence of Stewart Harrison for Daresbury Limited (Quantity Surveying) 20 September 2023, Appendix 2

Brick Paving - Supply and Install Border with Paved Brick Infill including New Concrete Base where Required	\$	60,000.00
Driveway - Resurface Asphalt	\$	36,610.00
Driveway - Reset Tile Paver Boarder to Asphalt Driveway where required	\$	3,600.00
Fountain - Requires Repair	\$	2,500.00

Sub Total		\$ 102,710.00
------------------	--	----------------------

Preliminaries	12.00%	12,325.20
Margins	10.00%	11,503.52
Contract Contingencies	10.00%	12,653.87
Other Development Costs	20.00%	27,838.52

Total Adjustment		\$ 167,031.11
-------------------------	--	----------------------

HIN 185 - Dwelling, Daresbury And Setting - 9 Daresbury Lane, 67 And 67B Fendalton Road Christchurch

Cost Fluctuation Adjustment Calculations By Indexation

MILNE CONSTRUCTION

Option 3 Rhodes + Associates Adjusted Option 2 (Changes To Value Of %'s of Margins, Contingencies, Professional Fees, P&G)

Option 3a Rhodes + Associates Adjusted Option 3 Less specified external works.

$$C=V \left[\frac{0.4(L-L')}{L'} + \frac{0.6(M-M')}{M'} \right]$$

		Period	Year/Quarter	Option 3	Option 3a	Difference Between Option 3 and 3a
				Rhodes + Associates Adjusted Option 2 (Changes To Value Of %'s of Margins, Contingencies, Professional Fees, P&G)	Rhodes + Associates Adjusted Option 3 Less specified external works.	
C	Cost fluctuation adjustment for the quarter under consideration, (rounded up to the nearest \$)			\$ 1,644,765.00	\$ 1,603,172.00	-\$ 41,593.00
	Daresbury House - Reduced Repair Quotation (03 July 2019)			\$ 6,339,790.00	\$ 6,339,790.00	\$ -
	Less external repair elements (brick paving, driveway and fountain) - See Appendix A				-\$ 160,320.04	-\$ 160,320.04
V	Valuation of work shown as payable in any Payment Schedule in respect of work having been completed during the quarter under consideration subject to A3, but without deduction of retentions and excluding the Cost fluctuation adjustment,			\$ 6,339,790.00	\$ 6,179,469.96	-\$ 160,320.04
L	Labour Cost Index; Private Sector: Industry Group – Construction: All Salary and Wage Rates: published by Statistics New Zealand, for the quarter under consideration,	April to June 2025	2025 Q2	1452	1452	1452
L'	Index as defined under L but applying for the quarter during which tenders close,	July to September 2019	2019 Q3	1227	1227	1227
M	Producers Price Index; Inputs: Industry Group – Construction, published by Statistics New Zealand applying for the quarter under consideration,	April to June 2025	2025 Q2	1563	1563	1563
M'	Index as defined under M but applying for the quarter during which tenders close.	July to September 2019	2019 Q3	1193	1193	1193
	Adjusted value (Rounded up to nearest \$)			\$ 7,984,555.00	\$ 7,782,642.00	-\$ 201,913.00
	Adjusted value per m2, based on 1,089 m2, note excludes external works elements brick paving, driveway and fountain (Rounded to nearest \$)			\$ 7,332.00	\$ 7,147.00	-\$ 185.00

STEWART HARRISON (20 September 2023)

- Option 4

Estimate in line with Statement of Evidence of Stewart Harrison for Daresbury Limited (Quantity Surveying) 20 September 2023, Appendix 2
- Option 4a

Stewart Harrison Adjusted Option 4 Less specified external works.

	Period	Year/Quarter	Option 4	Option 4a	Difference Between Option 4 and 4a
			Estimate in line with Statement of Evidence of Stewart Harrison for Daresbury Limited (Quantity Surveying) 20 September 2023, Appendix 2	Stewart Harrison Adjusted Option 4 Less specified external works.	
C	Cost fluctuation adjustment for the quarter under consideration, (rounded up to the nearest \$)		\$ 309,505.00	\$ 303,145.00	-\$ 6,360.00
	Estimate from Statement of Evidence of Stewart Harrison for Daresbury Limited (Qauntity Surveying) 20 September 2023, Appendix 2		\$ 8,127,788.00	\$ 8,127,788.00	\$ -
	Less external repair elements (brick paving, driveway and fountain) - See Appendix A			-\$ 167,031.11	-\$ 167,031.11
V	Valuation of work shown as payable in any Payment Schedule in respect of work having been completed during the quarter under consideration subject to A3, but without deduction of retentions and excluding the Cost fluctuation adjustment,		\$ 8,127,788.00	\$ 7,960,756.89	-\$ 167,031.11
L	Labour Cost Index; Private Sector: Industry Group – Construction: All Salary and Wage Rates: published by Statistics New Zealand, for the quarter under consideration,	April to June 2025	2025 Q2	1452	1452
L'	Index as defined under L but applying for the quarter during which tenders close,	July to September 2023	2023 Q3	1390	1390
M	Producers Price Index; Inputs: Industry Group – Construction, published by Statistics New Zealand applying for the quarter under consideration,	April to June 2025	2025 Q2	1563	1563
M'	Index as defined under M but applying for the quarter during which tenders close.	July to September 2023	2023 Q3	1512	1512
	Adjusted value (Rounded up to nearest \$)		\$ 8,437,293.00	\$ 8,263,902.00	-\$ 173,391.00
	Adjusted value per m2, based on 1,089 m2, note also includes for brick paving, driveway and fountain (Rounded to nearest \$)		\$ 7,748.00	\$ 7,589.00	-\$ 159.00