

Before the Independent Commissioner

Under the Resource Management Act 1991

In the matter of an application by Foodstuffs South Island Limited for the establishment and operation of a PAK'nSAVE supermarket and fuel station at 191 Main North Road, and associated car parking, vehicle access, landscaping, signage, and storm water treatment (RMA/2018/2029)

Joint Witness Statement: Landscape

1 November 2019

- 1 This joint witness statement sets out the extent of matters agreed as at 25 October 2019 between the experts listed below with respect to landscape and visual matters arising from RMA/2018/2029.
- 2 The expert conferencing was held at Christchurch City Council on Friday 25 October 2019. This followed a meeting of the two experts at the office of Rough and Milne on Tuesday 22 October.
- 3 Participants at the meeting were:

Jennifer Dray – Christchurch City Council

Tony Milne – Foodstuffs South Island Ltd
- 4 In preparing this statement, the expert witnesses have read and understood the Code of Conduct for Expert Witnesses as included in the Environment Court of New Zealand Practice Note 2014.

Background

- 5 An appropriate landscape and visual effects assessment framework for the application should consider the provisions in the Christchurch District Plan Chapter 3 – Strategic Directions, Chapter 15 – Commercial Zone, and given the Application Site’s underlying zoning, Chapter 16 – Industrial Zone. It is acknowledged however that neither Chapters 15 or 16 are a perfect fit for the application, and that site and activity-specific consideration should be brought to bear on any assessment. There was little discussion as to the weighting that should be given to the relevant policies and matters of discretion within these Chapters when assessing landscape and visual amenity matters and effects of the proposal. However, it was agreed these should provide guidance when assessing the potential landscape and visual effects of the proposal.

Matters Agreed

Key Landscape and Visual Amenity Matters

- 6 **Use of exotic deciduous trees** - it was agreed that the use of exotic deciduous trees within the proposed car park, and in places to the perimeter of the application site will provide a better landscape and visual amenity outcome than solely a native plant palette as previously advocated by Council’s ecologist.
- 7 **Additional screening to the fuel facility** - it was agreed that visual amenity effects arising from the location of the proposed fuel facility adjacent to the Main North Road frontage of the site can be adequately mitigated through the addition of two trees to the Main North Road frontage planting. These shall be planted in a position

the provides further visual screening of the fuel facility from the users of Main North Road.

- 8 Following 7 above, it was agreed that the design of the fuel facility structure could be less utilitarian and subject to operational requirements, should be redesigned. The fuel facility at the Frankton Pak n Save, Queenstown was cited as an example of a design that is receptive to, and acceptable within the context of its setting.
- 9 **Additional tree planting to front of supermarket** - it was agreed that additional tree planting to the front (east elevation) of the supermarket would provide a more desirous landscape and amenity outcome. Such trees would provide visual way finding clues and reinforce pedestrian movement through the application site. Tony Milne offered that there was a design solution available within the current layout of the site. It was agreed the planting to front of the supermarket should be reviewed.
- 10 **Lydia Street access planting** - In regard to the mitigation provided by the proposed planting adjacent to the northern boundary shared with residential dwellings, particularly those at 21 to 15 Northcote Road it was agreed that further information shall be included on the Resource Consent application landscape plan. Tony Milne suggested the tree species *Alnus joreullensis* would be an appropriate tree to afford mitigation of effects along this boundary. Additionally, Jennifer Dray suggested a condition of consent in relation to the planting and it was agreed this would be appropriate.

Key CPTED Matters

- 11 **Lighting** - it was agreed that lighting standards to the main car park area and to the rear of the supermarket building can be adequately provided for by way of a condition of consent.

General Urban Design Matters (also included within UD JWS)

- 12 **Connectivity** - it was agreed that in the context of its setting, general walkability and connectivity of the application site to the surrounding streets was important.
- 13 **Connectivity to the East (Main North Road)** Considering the proposed bus stop location on Main North Road, it was agreed that with further landscape enhancement, the proposed northern pedestrian route between Main North Road and the supermarket should function as the primary pedestrian link into the application site from Main North Road. It was agreed that this could be achieved by way of surface materials and planting.
- 14 Allied to 15 above, it was agreed this northern-most pedestrian link connection to the supermarket needs landscape enhancement at and around the entry to the building to give it similar status to the southern market entry.

- 15 **Connectivity to the South** - it was agreed this is desirable, but traffic related matters appear to conflict with a better aligned pedestrian path. It was agreed that the proposed southern link from Main North Road into the site is circuitous and from an urban design and landscape outcome is not the most desirous. A straighter route that avoided the crossing at the junction with Main North Road would be preferred. It was also acknowledged that given the position of the traffic experts, that for traffic and safety reasons this may be difficult to achieve.
- 16 **Lydia Street Accessway** - it was agreed that traffic safety, and general safety and amenity of the 1.2m wide path along Lydia Street access way was, in the context of this resource consent application i.e. the function of the supermarket, just acceptable. It was also agreed, that given the Lydia Street access way needs to be two-way, any widening of the foot path would result in a narrowing of the proposed garden and therefore would result in a negative effect on the amenity being provided by the planting.
- 17 **Connectivity to the North** - it was agreed that some minor realignment of the paths between the north east corner of the proposed supermarket and the Commercial Local centre would result in a more direct and legible pedestrian route. It was also agreed that if the vehicle connection with the Commercial Local centre was not required then the legibility and safety of pedestrian circulation within this area of the application site would be improved.
- 18 **Cycle connections** - it was agreed these should be included and indicated in the Proposal from Northcote Road (links back to Northern Line Cycle Way) into the Site. It was unclear to what extent Abley Transportation Consultants, and Council traffic officers, had already discussed this matter.

Matters Disagreed

- 19 **Additional landscape mitigation within south west corner of car park** - Jennifer Dray considers that additional landscape mitigation is required in the southern portion of car park adjoining fuel facility, particularly along the pedestrian path adjoining the left turning lane onto main North Road (where drop down bollards are located). Primarily, concerns here relate to footpath width, legibility and safety, and visual amenity from the main road entrance. Tony Milne agreed that the amenity outcome within this area of the application site could be improved. However, he outlined that several operational and circulation requirements have dictated the proposed site design within this area. There was no overall agreement in relation to this matter.
- 20 **Fuel facility location** - Jennifer Dray suggested locating the fuel facility elsewhere within the site or moving it northwards to provide room for more direct pedestrian connection from Main North Road mid-way through the car park area. Tony Milne outlined that the location of the fuel facility as shown on the application plans has

been dictated by operational requirements – primarily fuel tanker servicing. There was no general agreement over its location, but it was agreed that an acceptable landscape and amenity outcome would result following the matters agreed on in 7 and 8 above.

- 21 **CPTED** - it was agreed that the area to the rear of the supermarket should be gated outside of business hours to avoid concealment and entrapment risks. It was acknowledged that this was a matter raised in the CPTED Assessment within the Rough and Milne Landscape and Urban Design Report. There was no overall agreement as to the location of the gates and Niko Young agreed to supply further gate location solutions to David Hattam and Jennifer Dray. There was no overall agreement on this matter.
- 22 **Northern boundary amenity** – following item 10 above, Jennifer Dray suggested a reduction in the size of the sign on the northern elevation of the building along with trellis or similar, to the existing boundary fences, could also be considered to assist in the mitigation of visual effects on these adjoining properties. Regarding building bulk and location, it was agreed that the planting would provide adequate mitigation in regard to building bulk and location. Regarding the size of the sign, there was no overall agreement on this matter.

Conclusion

- 23 Regarding landscape and visual amenity effects, it was agreed that through some minor changes to the landscape plan in combination with consent conditions, these can be appropriately managed, and the proposal is acceptable. Therefore, it is agreed RMA/2018/2029 can be supported on landscape and visual amenity grounds.

Dated 1 November 2019



Tony D. Milne



Jennifer Dray